

IN THE UNITED STATES COURT OF APPEALS  
FOR THE DISTRICT OF COLUMBIA CIRCUIT

STATE OF WEST VIRGINIA, et al.,

*Petitioners,*

v.

UNITED STATES ENVIRONMENTAL  
PROTECTION AGENCY, et al.,

*Respondents.*

No. 15-1363 and  
consolidated cases

**PETITIONERS' AND PETITIONER-INTERVENORS' RESPONSE IN  
SUPPORT OF EPA'S MOTION TO HOLD CASES IN ABEYANCE**

Petitioners and Petitioner-Intervenors respectfully submit this response in support of EPA's motion to hold these consolidated cases in abeyance in light of EPA's announcement that it has commenced a review of the Rule pursuant to the recent Executive Order.<sup>1</sup> Holding petitions for review in abeyance is the Court's usual response when, as here, the agency has indicated that it is undertaking a review of the challenged regulation, especially in the context of a turnover of presidential administrations. That policy has special force when pending agency action could render a challenge moot: Here, there is a real risk that a decision by this Court on the

---

<sup>1</sup> The Executive Order is included as Attachment 1 to the Notice of Executive Order, EPA Review of Clean Power Plan and Forthcoming Rulemaking, and Motion to Hold Cases in Abeyance, ECF No. 1668274 (Mar. 28, 2017) ("EPA Motion").

legality of the existing Rule will amount to a mere advisory opinion because the Rule may well be repealed or substantially altered in the near future. Similarly, further action by this Court on this case would unnecessarily expend judicial and party resources while lacking practical effect in light of the stay entered by the Supreme Court—an action predicated on the Supreme Court’s determination that Petitioners are likely to succeed on the merits and that the balance of equities weighs against allowing the Rule to go into effect. Any concerns about EPA’s review carrying on indefinitely can be addressed by accepting the agency’s offer to report to the Court periodically on the status of its review. The Court should therefore grant EPA’s motion to hold these cases in abeyance.

As detailed in EPA’s motion, the President issued an Executive Order on March 28 that established a new energy policy of the United States focused on developing domestic energy sources, including coal and natural gas, free of regulations that “unduly burden the development or use” of these resources. Promoting Energy Independence and Economic Growth, Executive Order No. 13783 of March 28, 2017, §§ 1(a), (c). Among other things, the Order specifically instructs EPA to review the Rule for consistency with this policy and, if appropriate, take action to “suspend[], revis[e], or rescind[]” the Rule. *Id.* § 4(a). In connection with this change in policy, the Order rescinds a number of prior presidential actions, including the President’s Climate Action Plan of June 2013 and the Presidential Memorandum on Power Sector

Carbon Pollution Standards, *id.* § 3(b), both of which served as cornerstones of the Rule, *see* 80 Fed. Reg. 64662, 64665, 64677 (Oct. 23, 2015).

This Court has repeatedly recognized that abeyance is appropriate when an agency is revisiting a challenged regulation, especially during a transition from one presidential administration to another. For example, in May 2008, petitioners challenged EPA's Ozone NAAQS Rule. After the January 2009 change in administrations, when briefing was already underway, EPA moved to hold the case in abeyance to allow the agency to review the 2008 revisions and determine whether they should be reconsidered. *See Mississippi v. EPA*, 744 F.3d 1334, 1341 (D.C. Cir. 2013). The Court granted the motion, holding the case in abeyance until further order of the Court. Order, *Mississippi v. EPA*, No. 08-1200 (D.C. Cir. Mar. 19, 2009); *see also* Order, *Mississippi v. EPA*, No. 08-1200 (D.C. Cir. Jan. 21, 2010) (granting a motion to continue the abeyance and denying a motion to resume the litigation). Likewise, in February 2009, the Court granted EPA's motion to hold in abeyance the State of California's challenge (originally filed in May 2008) to EPA's denial of a waiver for new motor vehicle emission standards so that EPA could reconsider the denial. Order, *California v. EPA*, No. 08-1178 (D.C. Cir. Feb. 25, 2009).<sup>2</sup>

---

<sup>2</sup> In this regard, as noted below, the Court's ordinary practice is reinforced by the fact that there are additional challenges to the Rule ripened by the denial of petitions for reconsideration, that remain to be briefed and argued. *See, e.g.*, Joint Motion to Sever and Consolidate, *West Virginia v. EPA*, No. 15-1363 (D.C. Cir. Feb. 24, 2017) (ECF No. 1663046).

These are just some of the cases this Court has held in abeyance to permit EPA to reconsider a challenged regulatory program, including as part of the transition to a new administration. *See* Order, *Am. Petroleum Inst. v. EPA*, No. 08-1277 (D.C. Cir. Apr. 1, 2009) (holding case in abeyance pending EPA reconsideration); Order, *Sierra Club v. EPA*, No. 09-1018 (D.C. Cir. Feb. 19, 2009) (similar); Order, *Nat. Res. Def. Council v. EPA*, No. 08-1250 (D.C. Cir. Dec. 3, 2008) (similar). Indeed, the Court recently held a challenge to the Affordable Care Act in abeyance in light of the presidential transition. *See* Order, *House of Representatives v. Burwell*, No. 16-5202 (D.C. Cir. Dec. 5, 2016).

These cases reflect this Court's long "recogni[tion] that '[a]dministrative reconsideration is a more expeditious and efficient means of achieving an adjustment of agency policy than is resort to the federal courts.'" *B.J. Alan Co. v. ICC*, 897 F.2d 561, 562 n.1 (D.C. Cir. 1990) (quoting *Pennsylvania v. ICC*, 590 F.2d 1187, 1194 (D.C. Cir. 1978)). And here, the case for abeyance is even stronger because, unlike in these other cases, the existing regulation has been stayed by the Supreme Court and thus cannot take immediate effect even if upheld by the Court. There is thus no possibility of harm to other parties or the public interest from a delay in this Court's consideration of the case while EPA revisits the Rule. *See infra*. And periodic status reports will give the Court the opportunity to ensure that EPA acts in a timely fashion, and allow the Court to pick up where it left off if EPA's review does not produce a material change to the Rule. *See* EPA Motion at 9 n.2. Simply preserving

the *status quo* until then is amply warranted—and indeed, is precisely what the Supreme Court found Petitioners are entitled to in light of the irrevocable harm threatened by the Rule and Petitioners’ likelihood of success on the merits.

The Court’s established practice of granting abeyance in cases like these is a sound one, because any decision by this Court on the legality of the Rule as initially promulgated could amount to an advisory opinion. The Executive Order directs EPA to “immediately take all steps necessary to review the [Rule].” Executive Order No. 13783, *supra*, § 4(a). If EPA concludes that the Rule—which was designed to “aggressive[ly] transform[]” the domestic electricity sector away from fossil fuels<sup>3</sup>—“unduly burden[s] the development of domestic energy resources” like coal and natural gas, *id.* § 1(c), it must “as soon as practicable” initiate a rulemaking proceeding to “suspend[], revis[e], or rescind[]” the Rule, *id.* § 4(a). As EPA’s motion explains, the agency has already implemented the first part of this directive by “immediately” commencing a review of the Rule and issuing a notice of review and advance notice of proposed rulemaking. EPA Motion at 7 & Att. 2.

If EPA rescinds or substantially modifies the Rule, the relief requested in the petitions for review will be unavailable because the Rule as it currently stands will no longer exist. Where “[e]ach cause of action challenge[s] the validity of” a regulation,

---

<sup>3</sup> White House Fact Sheet (attached to State Pet’rs’ Mot. for Stay and Expedited Consideration of Petition for Review, *West Virginia v. EPA*, No. 15-1363 (D.C. Cir. Oct. 23, 2015) (ECF 1579999)).

and “that regulation no longer exists, [the Court] can do nothing to affect [petitioners’] rights relative to it, thus making th[e] case classically moot for lack of a live controversy.” *Akiachak Native Cmty. v. Dep’t of Interior*, 827 F.3d 100, 106 (D.C. Cir. 2016); *see also Am. Petroleum Inst. v. EPA*, 683 F.3d 382, 388 (D.C. Cir. 2012) (holding case in abeyance where EPA’s proposed course “if adopted, would necessitate substantively different legal analysis and would likely moot the analysis we could undertake if deciding the case now”); *Larsen v. U.S. Navy*, 525 F.3d 1, 4–5 (D.C. Cir. 2008) (challenge to withdrawn policy was moot); *Coal. of Airline Pilots Ass’ns v. FAA*, 370 F.3d 1184, 1190–91 (D.C. Cir. 2004) (similar); *cf. U.S. Bancorp Mortg. Co. v. Bonner Mall P’ship*, 513 U.S. 18, 25 n.3 (1994) (noting that a prior suit “became moot on appeal because the regulations sought to be enforced by the United States were annulled by Executive Order”). As a result, an opinion regarding the legality of the Rule after EPA has already withdrawn or revised it “would accomplish nothing—amounting to exactly the type of advisory opinion Article III prohibits.” *Akiachak Native Cmty.*, 827 F.3d at 106 (internal quotation marks omitted). Nor is this a case in which the legal issues raised by the Rule will necessarily survive EPA’s action rescinding or modifying the Rule; unlike in cases such as *Chlorine Chemistry Council v. EPA*, 206 F.3d 1286, 1290 (D.C. Cir. 2000), EPA’s rescission or modification may very well obviate Petitioners’ challenges here.<sup>4</sup>

---

<sup>4</sup> The Supreme Court’s recent denial of an abeyance request in *National*

Even if the Court were to issue a decision before EPA completed an effort to rewrite or repeal the Rule, EPA's forthcoming action could still moot the case, and the parties would be entitled to seek vacatur of the Court's ruling in this Court, *see Clarke v. United States*, 915 F.2d 699, 706 (D.C. Cir. 1990) (en banc), or in the Supreme Court, *see Arizonans for Official English v. Arizona*, 520 U.S. 43, 71 (1997) ("When a civil case becomes moot pending appellate adjudication, '[t]he established practice ... in the federal system ... is to reverse or vacate the judgment below and remand with a direction to dismiss.'" (quoting *United States v. Munsingwear, Inc.*, 340 U.S. 36, 39 (1950))); *see also Am. Bar Ass'n v. FTC*, 636 F.3d 641, 649 (D.C. Cir. 2011) (explaining the reasons favoring vacatur based on intervening legislative changes). Indeed, the Supreme Court is highly unlikely to allow such important issues to be determined by a decision that it may not be able to review. *See Munsingwear*, 340 U.S. at 40 (vacatur is proper to "clear[] the path for future relitigation of the issues"); *see also A.L. Mechling Barge Lines, Inc. v. United States*, 368 U.S. 324, 329 (1961) ("We think the principle enunciated in *Munsingwear* at least equally applicable to unreviewed administrative orders...."); *cf. Relf v. Weinberger*, 565 F.2d 722, 727 (D.C. Cir. 1977) (vacating orders

---

*Association of Manufacturers v. Department of Defense*, *see* Order, No. 16-299 (S. Ct. Apr. 3, 2017), likewise says nothing about the appropriateness of abeyance in these cases. The question presented to the Supreme Court is limited to whether the federal courts of appeals, or instead the federal district courts, have jurisdiction to review a rule defining the term "waters of the United States" under 33 U.S.C. § 1369(b)(1)(F). This jurisdictional question about the proper forum for review will be implicated by any rule defining the reach of the Clean Water Act.

where agency announced its “inten[tion] to issue a new notice of rule making ... at the conclusion of which it will promulgate [new] comprehensive regulations”).<sup>5</sup>

Finally, for many of the same reasons, a decision by this Court regarding the current Rule would require an unnecessary expenditure of additional party and judicial resources. Although briefing and oral argument have taken place on challenges to the Rule in Case No. 15-1363, this Court has not yet issued its decision, and there are now additional challenges to the Rule ripened by the denial of petitions for reconsideration that remain to be briefed and argued. *See supra* n.2. The Court thus would need to expend the significant resources to resolve all issues, to issue a decision for the *en banc* Court, as well as any separate concurrences or dissents, and, potentially, deal with any petitions for rehearing. The non-prevailing parties surely would file protective petitions for writs of certiorari in the Supreme Court, requiring all of the numerous parties and the Justices to expend further resources. Given the large number of parties and counsel involved in this matter and the complexity of the issues, such an effort would be extensive. Because, as explained above, the case could ultimately be mooted by EPA’s forthcoming action, all of this effort would be wasted.

---

<sup>5</sup> The Executive Order’s rescission of the presidential actions that formed the cornerstone of the Rule indicates that substantial revisions or even rescission of the Rule is not merely speculative. In any event, EPA’s requested abeyance, EPA Motion at 8-9, would allow for an orderly review of the Rule. As EPA notes, it can provide periodic status reports on the progress of its review, allowing the Court to pick up where it left off if EPA decides no further action is necessary. *See id.* at 9 n.2 (offering to provide periodic status reports).



Moreover, a decision by this Court would have no practical effect while EPA revisits the Rule because the Supreme Court has stayed the Rule pending disposition of any petitions for writs of certiorari (or a decision on the merits if the petitions are granted). Order, *Chamber of Commerce v. EPA*, 136 S. Ct. 999 (2016) (No. 15A787). Thus, even if this Court were to uphold the Rule, the Rule would not take effect until, at the very least, the Supreme Court denied the inevitable petitions for writs of certiorari. And such a denial is highly unlikely, given the importance of the issues, EPA's ongoing efforts to revisit the Rule, and the fact that, in staying the Rule, the Supreme Court necessarily found that a petition for certiorari filed by Petitioners would likely be granted.

For the foregoing reasons, Petitioners and Petitioner-Intervenors support EPA's motion to hold this case in abeyance.

Dated: April 6, 2017

/s/ F. William Brownell

F. William Brownell  
Allison D. Wood  
Henry V. Nickel  
Tauna M. Szymanski  
HUNTON & WILLIAMS LLP  
2200 Pennsylvania Avenue, N.W.  
Washington, D.C. 20037  
Tel: (202) 955-1500  
bbrownell@hunton.com  
awood@hunton.com  
hnickel@hunton.com  
tszymanski@hunton.com

*Counsel for Petitioners Utility Air Regulatory  
Group and American Public Power Association*

/s/ Peter S. Glaser

Peter S. Glaser  
TROUTMAN SANDERS LLP  
401 Ninth Street N.W., Suite 1000  
Washington, D.C. 20004  
Tel: (202) 274-2998  
peter.glaser@troutmansanders.com

Carroll W. McGuffey III  
Justin T. Wong  
TROUTMAN SANDERS LLP  
600 Peachtree Street, N.E., Suite 5200  
Atlanta, GA 30308  
Tel: (404) 885-3000  
mack.mcguffey@troutmansanders.com  
justin.wong@troutmansanders.com

*Counsel for Petitioner National Mining  
Association*

Respectfully submitted,

/s/ Elbert Lin

Patrick Morrissey  
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF WEST  
VIRGINIA  
Elbert Lin  
Solicitor General  
*Counsel of Record*  
Erica N. Peterson  
Assistant Attorney General  
State Capitol Building 1, Room 26-E  
Charleston, WV 25305  
Tel: (304) 558-2021  
Fax: (304) 558-0140  
elbert.lin@wvago.gov

*Counsel for Petitioner State of West Virginia*

/s/ Scott A. Keller

Ken Paxton  
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS  
Jeffrey C. Mateer  
First Assistant Attorney General  
Scott A. Keller  
Solicitor General  
*Counsel of Record*  
P.O. Box 12548  
Austin, TX 78711-2548  
Tel: (512) 936-1700  
scott.keller@texasattorneygeneral.gov

*Counsel for Petitioner State of Texas*

/s/ Peter D. Keisler \_\_\_\_\_

Peter D. Keisler  
C. Frederick Beckner III  
Ryan C. Morris  
Paul J. Ray  
SIDLEY AUSTIN, LLP  
1501 K Street, N.W.  
Washington, D.C. 20005  
Tel: (202) 736-8027  
pkeisler@sidley.com  
rbeckner@sidley.com

*Counsel for Petitioners Chamber of Commerce of the United States of America; National Association of Manufacturers; American Fuel & Petrochemical Manufacturers; National Federation of Independent Business; American Chemistry Council; American Coke and Coal Chemicals Institute; American Foundry Society; American Forest & Paper Association; American Iron & Steel Institute; American Wood Council; Brick Industry Association; Electricity Consumers Resource Council; Lignite Energy Council; National Lime Association; National Oilseed Processors Association; and Portland Cement Association*

/s/ Andrew Brasher \_\_\_\_\_

Steven T. Marshall  
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF ALABAMA  
Andrew Brasher  
Solicitor General  
*Counsel of Record*  
501 Washington Avenue  
Montgomery, AL 36130  
Tel: (334) 353-2609  
abrasher@ago.state.al.us

*Counsel for Petitioner State of Alabama*

/s/ Thomas A. Lorenzen

Thomas A. Lorenzen  
D.C. Cir. Bar No. 394369  
Daniel W. Wolff  
CROWELL & MORING LLP  
1001 Pennsylvania Ave., N.W.  
Washington, D.C. 20004  
Tel: (202) 624-2500  
tlorenzen@crowell.com  
dwolff@crowell.com

*Counsel for Petitioners National Rural Electric Cooperative Association; Big Rivers Electric Corporation; Brazos Electric Power Cooperative, Inc.; Buckeye Power, Inc.; Central Montana Electric Power Cooperative; Central Electric Power Cooperative, Inc., Corn Belt Power Cooperative; Dairyland Power Cooperative; East River Electric Power Cooperative, Inc.; Georgia Transmission Corporation; Kansas Electric Power Cooperative, Inc.; North Carolina Electric Membership Corporation; Northwest Iowa Power Cooperative; Oglethorpe Power Corporation; PowerSouth Energy Cooperative; Prairie Power, Inc.; Rushmore Electric Power Cooperative, Inc.; Seminole Electric Cooperative, Inc.; Southern Illinois Power Cooperative; Sunflower Electric Power Corporation; and Upper Missouri G. & T. Electric Cooperative, Inc.*

/s/ Lee Rudofsky

Leslie Rutledge  
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF ARKANSAS  
Lee Rudofsky  
Solicitor General  
*Counsel of Record*  
Jamie L. Ewing  
Assistant Attorney General  
323 Center Street, Suite 400  
Little Rock, AR 72201  
Tel: (501) 682-5310  
lee.rudofsky@arkansasag.gov

*Counsel for Petitioner State of Arkansas*

/s/ Frederick Yarger

Cynthia H. Coffman  
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF COLORADO  
Frederick Yarger  
Solicitor General  
*Counsel of Record*  
1300 Broadway, 10th Floor  
Denver, CO 80203  
Tel: (720) 508-6168  
fred.yarger@coag.gov

*Counsel for Petitioner State of Colorado*

*Of Counsel*

Rae Cronmiller  
Environmental Counsel  
NATIONAL RURAL ELECTRIC  
COOPERATIVE ASSOCIATION  
4301 Wilson Blvd.  
Arlington, VA 22203  
Tel: (703) 907-5500  
rae.cronmiller@nreca.coop

*Counsel for Petitioner National Rural Electric  
Cooperative Association*

/s/ Eric L. Hiser

Eric L. Hiser  
JORDEN BISCHOFF & HISER, PLC  
7272 E. Indian School Road, Suite 360  
Scottsdale, AZ 85251  
Tel: (480) 505-3927  
ehiser@jordenbischoff.com

*Counsel for Petitioner Arizona Electric Power  
Cooperative, Inc.*

/s/ Brian A. Prestwood

Brian A. Prestwood  
Senior Corporate and Compliance  
Counsel  
ASSOCIATED ELECTRIC COOPERATIVE,  
INC.  
2814 S. Golden, P.O. Box 754  
Springfield, MO 65801  
Tel: (417) 885-9273  
bprestwood@aeci.org

*Counsel for Petitioner Associated Electric  
Cooperative, Inc.*

/s/ Jonathan L. Williams

Pamela Jo Bondi  
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF FLORIDA  
Jonathan L. Williams  
Deputy Solicitor General  
*Counsel of Record*  
Jonathan A. Glogau  
Special Counsel  
Office of the Attorney General  
PL-01, The Capitol  
Tallahassee, FL 32399-1050  
Tel: (850) 414-3818  
Fax: (850) 410-2672  
jonathan.williams@myfloridalegal.com  
jonathan.glogau@myfloridalegal.com

*Counsel for Petitioner State of Florida*

/s/ Sarah Hawkins Warren

Christopher M. Carr  
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF GEORGIA  
Sarah Hawkins Warren  
Solicitor General  
*Counsel of Record*  
40 Capitol Square S.W.  
Atlanta, GA 30334  
Tel: (404) 656-3300  
Fax: (404) 463-9453  
swarren@law.ga.gov

*Counsel for Petitioner State of Georgia*

/s/ David Crabtree  
David Crabtree  
Vice President, General Counsel  
DESERET GENERATION & TRANSMISSION  
CO-OPERATIVE  
10714 South Jordan Gateway  
South Jordan, UT 84095  
Tel: (801) 619-9500  
Crabtree@deseretpower.com

*Counsel for Petitioner Deseret Generation &  
Transmission Co-operative*

/s/ John M. Holloway III  
John M. Holloway III  
EVERSHEDS SUTHERLAND (US) LLP  
700 Sixth Street, N.W., Suite 700  
Washington, D.C. 20001  
Tel: (202) 383-0100  
Fax: (202) 383-3593  
jayholloway@eversheds-  
sutherland.com

*Counsel for Petitioners East Kentucky Power  
Cooperative, Inc.; Hoosier Energy Rural Electric  
Cooperative, Inc.; Minnkota Power Cooperative,  
Inc.; and South Mississippi Electric Power  
Association*

/s/ Thomas M. Fisher  
Curtis T. Hill, Jr.  
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF INDIANA  
Thomas M. Fisher  
Solicitor General  
*Counsel of Record*  
Indiana Government Ctr. South  
Fifth Floor  
302 West Washington Street  
Indianapolis, IN 46205  
Tel: (317) 232-6247  
tom.fisher@atg.in.gov

*Counsel for Petitioner State of Indiana*

/s/ Jeffrey A. Chanay  
Derek Schmidt  
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF KANSAS  
Jeffrey A. Chanay  
Chief Deputy Attorney General  
*Counsel of Record*  
Bryan C. Clark  
Assistant Solicitor General  
120 S.W. 10th Avenue, 3rd Floor  
Topeka, KS 66612  
Tel: (785) 368-8435  
Fax: (785) 291-3767  
jeff.chanay@ag.ks.gov

*Counsel for Petitioner State of Kansas*

/s/ Patrick Burchette

Patrick Burchette  
HOLLAND & KNIGHT LLP  
800 17<sup>th</sup> Street, N.W., Suite 1100  
Washington, D.C. 20006  
Tel: (202) 469-5102  
Patrick.Burchette@hkllaw.com

*Counsel for Petitioners East Texas Electric Cooperative, Inc.; Northeast Texas Electric Cooperative, Inc.; Sam Rayburn G&T Electric Cooperative, Inc.; and Tex-La Electric Cooperative of Texas, Inc.*

/s/ Christopher L. Bell

Christopher L. Bell  
GREENBERG TRAURIG LLP  
1000 Louisiana Street, Suite 1700  
Houston, TX 77002  
Tel: (713) 374-3556  
bellc@gtllaw.com

*Counsel for Petitioner Golden Spread Electrical Cooperative, Inc.*

/s/ Mark Walters

Mark Walters  
Michael J. Nasi  
JACKSON WALKER L.L.P.  
100 Congress Avenue, Suite 1100  
Austin, TX 78701  
Tel: (512) 236-2000  
Fax: (512) 236-2002  
mwalters@jw.com  
mnasi@jw.com

*Counsel for Petitioners San Miguel Electric Cooperative, Inc., South Texas Electric Cooperative, Inc., and Petitioner-Intervenor Gulf Coast Lignite Coalition*

/s/ Joe Newberg

Andy Beshear  
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF KENTUCKY  
Mitchel T. Denham  
Assistant Deputy Attorney General  
Joseph A. Newberg, II  
Assistant Attorney General  
*Counsel of Record*  
700 Capital Avenue  
Suite 118  
Frankfort, KY 40601  
Tel: (502) 696-5611  
joe.newberg@ky.gov

*Counsel for Petitioner Commonwealth of Kentucky*

/s/ Steven B. "Beaux" Jones

Jeff Landry  
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF LOUISIANA  
Steven B. "Beaux" Jones  
*Counsel of Record*  
Duncan S. Kemp, IV  
Assistant Attorneys General  
Environmental Section – Civil Division  
1885 N. Third Street  
Baton Rouge, LA 70804  
Tel: (225) 326-6085  
Fax: (225) 326-6099  
jonesst@ag.state.la.us

*Counsel for Petitioner State of Louisiana*

/s/ Randolph G. Holt  
Randolph G. Holt  
Jeremy L. Fetty  
PARR RICHEY OBREMSKEY FRANSEN &  
PATTERSON LLP  
Wabash Valley Power Association, Inc.  
722 N. High School Road  
P.O. Box 24700  
Indianapolis, IN 46224  
Tel: (317) 481-2815  
R\_holt@wvpa.com  
jfetty@parrlaw.com

*Counsel for Petitioner Wabash Valley Power  
Association, Inc.*

/s/ Megan H. Berge  
Megan H. Berge  
BAKER BOTTS L.L.P.  
1299 Pennsylvania Avenue, N.W.  
Washington, D.C. 20004  
Tel: (202) 639-7700  
megan.berge@bakerbotts.com

*Counsel for Petitioner Western Farmers Electric  
Cooperative*

/s/ Steven C. Kohl  
Steven C. Kohl  
Gaetan Gerville-Reache  
WARNER NORCROSS & JUDD LLP  
2000 Town Center, Suite 2700  
Southfield, MI 48075-1318  
Tel: (248) 784-5000  
skohl@wnj.com

*Counsel for Petitioner Wolverine Power Supply  
Cooperative, Inc.*

/s/ Lesley Foxhall Pietras  
Lesley Foxhall Pietras  
Greg Johnson  
LISKOW & LEWIS, P.L.C.  
701 Poydras Street, Suite 5000  
New Orleans, LA 70139  
Tel: (504) 556-4010  
Fax: (504) 556-4108  
lfpietras@liskow.com

*Counsel for Petitioner Louisiana Public Service  
Commission*



/s/ Christina F. Gomez  
Christina F. Gomez  
Jill H. Van Noord  
Holland & Hart LLP  
555 Seventeenth Street, Suite 3200  
Denver, CO 80202  
Tel: (303) 295-8000  
Fax: (303) 295-8261  
cgomez@hollandhart.com  
jhvan Noord@hollandhart.com

Patrick R. Day  
HOLLAND & HART LLP  
2515 Warren Avenue, Suite 450  
Cheyenne, WY 82001  
Tel: (307) 778-4200  
Fax: (307) 778-8175  
pday@hollandhart.com

Emily C. Schilling  
HOLLAND & HART LLP  
222 South Main Street, Suite 2200  
Salt Lake City, UT 84101  
Tel: (801) 799-5800  
Fax: (801) 799-5700  
ecschilling@hollandhart.com

*Counsel for Petitioner Basin Electric Power  
Cooperative*

/s/ Aaron D. Lindstrom  
Bill Schuette  
ATTORNEY GENERAL FOR THE PEOPLE  
OF MICHIGAN  
Aaron D. Lindstrom  
Michigan Solicitor General  
*Counsel of Record*  
P.O. Box 30212  
Lansing, MI 48909  
Tel: (515) 373-1124  
Fax: (517) 373-3042  
lindstroma@michigan.gov

*Counsel for Petitioner People of the State of  
Michigan*

/s/ Harold E. Pizzetta, III  
Jim Hood  
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF THE STATE OF  
MISSISSIPPI  
Harold E. Pizzetta  
Assistant Attorney General  
Civil Litigation Division  
Office of the Attorney General  
Post Office Box 220  
Jackson, MS 39205  
Tel: (601) 359-3816  
Fax: (601) 359-2003  
hpizz@ago.state.ms.us

*Counsel for Petitioner State of Mississippi*

/s/ C. Grady Moore, III  
C. Grady Moore, III  
Steven G. McKinney  
BALCH & BINGHAM LLP  
1901 Sixth Avenue North, Suite 1500  
Birmingham, AL 35303-4642  
Tel: (205) 251-8100  
Fax: (205) 488-5704  
gmoore@balch.com  
smckinney@balch.com

*Counsel for Petitioner Alabama Power Company*

/s/ Margaret Claiborne Campbell  
Margaret Claiborne Campbell  
Angela J. Levin  
TROUTMAN SANDERS LLP  
600 Peachtree Street, NE, Suite 5200  
Atlanta, GA 30308-2216  
Tel: (404) 885-3000  
margaret.campbell@troutmansanders.com  
angela.levin@troutmansanders.com

*Counsel for Petitioner Georgia Power Company*

/s/ Donna J. Hodges  
Donna J. Hodges  
Senior Counsel  
MISSISSIPPI DEPARTMENT OF  
ENVIRONMENTAL QUALITY  
P.O. Box 2261  
Jackson, MS 39225-2261  
Tel: (601) 961-5369  
Fax: (601) 961-5349  
dhodges@deq.state.ms.us

*Counsel for Petitioner Mississippi Department of  
Environmental Quality*

/s/ Todd E. Palmer  
Todd E. Palmer  
Valerie L. Green  
MICHAEL, BEST & FRIEDRICH LLP  
601 Pennsylvania Ave., N.W., Suite 700  
Washington, D.C. 20004-2601  
Tel: (202) 747-9560  
Fax: (202) 347-1819  
tepalmer@michaelbest.com  
vlgreen@michaelbest.com

*Counsel for Petitioner Mississippi Public Service  
Commission*

/s/ Terese T. Wyly

Terese T. Wyly  
Ben H. Stone  
BALCH & BINGHAM LLP  
1310 Twenty Fifth Avenue  
Gulfport, MS 39501-1931  
Tel: (228) 214-0413  
twyly@balch.com  
bstone@balch.com

*Counsel for Petitioner Mississippi Power  
Company*

/s/ Jeffrey A. Stone

Jeffrey A. Stone  
BEGGS & LANE, RLLP  
501 Commendencia Street  
Pensacola, FL 32502  
Tel: (850) 432-2451  
JAS@beggslane.com

James S. Alves  
2110 Trescott Drive  
Tallahassee, FL 32308  
Tel: (850) 566-7607  
jim.s.alves@outlook.com

*Counsel for Petitioner Gulf Power Company*

/s/ D. John Sauer

Josh Hawley  
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF MISSOURI  
D. John Sauer  
Solicitor General  
*Counsel of Record*  
P.O. Box 899  
207 W. High Street  
Jefferson City, MO 65102  
Tel: (573) 751-1800  
Fax: (573) 751-0774  
john.sauer@ago.mo.gov

*Counsel for Petitioner State of Missouri*

/s/ Dale Schowengerdt

Timothy C. Fox  
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF MONTANA  
Dale Schowengerdt  
Solicitor General  
*Counsel of Record*  
215 North Sanders  
Helena, MT 59620-1401  
Tel: (406) 444-7008  
dales@mt.gov

*Counsel for Petitioner State of Montana*

/s/ James S. Alves  
James S. Alves  
2110 Trescott Drive  
Tallahassee, FL 32308  
Tel: (850) 566-7607  
jim.s.alves@outlook.com

*Counsel for Petitioner CO<sub>2</sub> Task Force of the  
Florida Electric Power Coordinating Group, Inc.*

/s/ John J. McMackin  
John J. McMackin  
WILLIAMS & JENSEN  
701 8th Street, N.W., Suite 500  
Washington, D.C. 20001  
Tel: (202) 659-8201  
jjmcmackin@wms-jen.com

*Counsel for Petitioner Energy-Intensive  
Manufacturers Working Group on Greenhouse  
Gas Regulation*

/s/ William M. Bumpers  
William M. Bumpers  
Megan H. Berge  
BAKER BOTTS L.L.P.  
1299 Pennsylvania Avenue, N.W.  
Washington, D.C. 20004  
Tel: (202) 639-7700  
william.bumpers@bakerbotts.com  
megan.berge@bakerbotts.com

Kelly McQueen  
ENTERGY SERVICES, INC.  
425 W. Capitol Avenue, 27th Floor  
Little Rock, AR 72201  
Tel: (501) 377-5760  
kmcque1@entergy.com

*Counsel for Petitioner Entergy Corporation*

/s/ Justin D. Lavene  
Douglas J. Peterson  
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF NEBRASKA  
Dave Bydlaek  
Chief Deputy Attorney General  
Justin D. Lavene  
Assistant Attorney General  
*Counsel of Record*  
2115 State Capitol  
Lincoln, NE 68509  
Tel: (402) 471-2834  
justin.lavene@nebraska.gov

*Counsel for Petitioner State of Nebraska*

/s/ John R. Renella  
Christopher S. Porrino  
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF NEW  
JERSEY  
David C. Apy  
Assistant Attorney General  
John R. Renella  
Deputy Attorney General  
*Counsel of Record*  
Division of Law  
R.J. Hughes Justice Complex  
P.O. Box 093  
25 Market Street  
Trenton, NJ 08625-0093  
Tel. (609) 292-6945  
Fax (609) 341-5030  
john.renella@dol.lps.state.nj.us

*Counsel for Petitioner State of New Jersey*

/s/ Paul J. Zidlicky  
Paul J. Zidlicky  
SIDLEY AUSTIN, LLP  
1501 K Street, N.W.  
Washington, D.C. 20005  
Tel: (202) 736-8000  
pzidlicky@sidley.com

*Counsel for Petitioners GenOn Mid-Atlantic, LLC; Indian River Power LLC; Louisiana Generating LLC; Midwest Generation, LLC; NRG Chalk Point LLC; NRG Power Midwest LP; NRG Rema LLC; NRG Texas Power LLC; NRG Wholesale Generation LP; and Vienna Power LLC*

/s/ David M. Flannery  
David M. Flannery  
Kathy G. Beckett  
Edward L. Kropp  
STEPTOE & JOHNSON, PLLC  
707 Virginia Street East  
Charleston, WV 25326  
Tel: (304) 353-8000  
dave.flannery@steptoe-johnson.com  
kathy.beckett@steptoe-johnson.com  
skipp.kropp@steptoe-johnson.com

*Counsel for Petitioner Indiana Utility Group*

/s/ Paul M. Seby  
Wayne Stenehjem  
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF NORTH  
DAKOTA  
Margaret Olson  
Assistant Attorney General  
North Dakota Attorney General's Office  
600 E. Boulevard Avenue #125  
Bismarck, ND 58505  
Tel: (701) 328-3640  
maiolson@nd.gov

Paul M. Seby  
Special Assistant Attorney General  
State of North Dakota  
GREENBERG TRAURIG, LLP  
1200 17th Street, Suite 2400  
Denver, CO 80202  
Tel: (303) 572-6500  
Fax: (303) 572-6540  
sebyp@gtlaw.com

*Counsel for Petitioner State of North Dakota*

/s/ Eric E. Murphy  
Michael DeWine  
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF OHIO  
Eric E. Murphy  
State Solicitor  
*Counsel of Record*  
30 E. Broad Street, 17th Floor  
Columbus, OH 43215  
Tel: (614) 466-8980  
eric.murphy@ohioattorneygeneral.gov

*Counsel for Petitioner State of Ohio*

/s/ F. William Brownell

F. William Brownell  
Eric J. Murdock  
HUNTON & WILLIAMS LLP  
2200 Pennsylvania Avenue, N.W.  
Washington, D.C. 20037  
Tel: (202) 955-1500  
bbrownell@hunton.com  
emurdock@hunton.com

Nash E. Long III  
HUNTON & WILLIAMS LLP  
Bank of America Plaza, Suite 3500  
101 South Tryon Street  
Charlotte, NC 28280  
Tel: (704) 378-4700  
nlong@hunton.com

*Counsel for Petitioner LG&E and KU Energy  
LLC*

/s/ David B. Rivkin, Jr.

Mike Hunter  
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF OKLAHOMA  
David B. Rivkin, Jr.  
*Counsel of Record*  
Mark W. DeLaquil  
Andrew M. Grossman  
BAKER & HOSTETLER LLP  
Washington Square, Suite 1100  
1050 Connecticut Ave., N.W.  
Washington, D.C. 20036  
Tel: (202) 861-1731  
Fax: (202) 861-1783  
drivkin@bakerlaw.com

*Counsel for Petitioners State of Oklahoma and  
Oklahoma Department of Environmental  
Quality*

/s/ P. Stephen Gidiere III

P. Stephen Gidiere III  
Thomas L. Casey III  
Julia B. Barber  
BALCH & BINGHAM LLP  
1901 6th Ave. N., Suite 1500  
Birmingham, AL 35203  
Tel: (205) 251-8100  
sgidiere@balch.com

Stephanie Z. Moore  
Executive Vice President & General  
Counsel  
VISTRA ENERGY CORP.  
1601 Bryan Street  
22nd Floor  
Dallas, Texas 75201

Daniel J. Kelly  
Vice President & Associate General  
Counsel  
VISTRA ENERGY CORP.  
1601 Bryan Street  
43rd Floor  
Dallas, Texas 75201

*Counsel for Petitioners Luminant Generation  
Company LLC; Oak Grove Management  
Company LLC; Big Brown Power Company  
LLC; Sandow Power Company LLC; Big  
Brown Lignite Company LLC; Luminant  
Mining Company LLC; and Luminant Big  
Brown Mining Company LLC*

/s/ James Emory Smith, Jr.

Alan Wilson  
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF SOUTH  
CAROLINA  
Robert D. Cook  
Solicitor General  
James Emory Smith, Jr.  
Deputy Solicitor General  
*Counsel of Record*  
P.O. Box 11549  
Columbia, SC 29211  
Tel: (803) 734-3680  
Fax: (803) 734-3677  
esmith@scag.gov

*Counsel for Petitioner State of South Carolina*

/s/ Steven R. Blair

Marty J. Jackley  
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF SOUTH  
DAKOTA  
Steven R. Blair  
Assistant Attorney General  
*Counsel of Record*  
1302 E. Highway 14, Suite 1  
Pierre, SD 57501  
Tel: (605) 773-3215  
steven.blair@state.sd.us

*Counsel for Petitioner State of South Dakota*

/s/ Ronald J. Tenpas  
Ronald J. Tenpas  
MORGAN, LEWIS & BOCKIUS LLP  
1111 Pennsylvania Avenue, N.W.  
Washington, D.C. 20004  
Tel: (202) 739-3000  
rtenpas@morganlewis.com

*Counsel for Petitioner Minnesota Power (an  
operating division of ALLETE, Inc.)*

/s/ Allison D. Wood  
Allison D. Wood  
Tauna M. Szymanski  
Andrew D. Knudsen  
HUNTON & WILLIAMS LLP  
2200 Pennsylvania Avenue, N.W.  
Washington, D.C. 20037  
Tel: (202) 955-1500  
awood@hunton.com  
tszymanski@hunton.com  
aknudsen@hunton.com

*Counsel for Petitioner Montana-Dakota Utilities  
Co., a Division of MDU Resources Group, Inc.*

/s/ Tyler R. Green  
Sean Reyes  
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF UTAH  
Tyler R. Green  
Solicitor General  
*Counsel of Record*  
Parker Douglas  
Federal Solicitor  
Utah State Capitol Complex  
350 North State Street, Suite 230  
Salt Lake City, UT 84114-2320  
pdouglas@utah.gov

*Counsel for Petitioner State of Utah*

/s/ Misha Tseytlin  
Brad D. Schimel  
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF WISCONSIN  
Misha Tseytlin  
Solicitor General  
*Counsel of Record*  
Andrew Cook  
Deputy Attorney General  
Delanie M. Breuer  
Assistant Deputy Attorney General  
Wisconsin Department of Justice  
17 West Main Street  
Madison, WI 53707  
Tel: (608) 267-9323  
tseytlinm@doj.state.wi.us

*Counsel for Petitioner State of Wisconsin*



/s/ William M. Bumpers

William M. Bumpers  
Megan H. Berge  
BAKER BOTTS L.L.P.  
1299 Pennsylvania Avenue, N.W.  
Washington, D.C. 20004  
Tel: (202) 639-7700  
william.bumpers@bakerbotts.com  
megan.berge@bakerbotts.com

*Counsel for Petitioner NorthWestern  
Corporation d/b/a NorthWestern Energy*

/s/ Joshua R. More

Joshua R. More  
Jane E. Montgomery  
Amy Antonioli  
SCHIFF HARDIN LLP  
233 South Wacker Drive  
Suite 6600  
Chicago, IL 60606  
Tel: (312) 258-5500  
jmore@schiffhardin.com  
jmontgomery@schiffhardin.com  
aantonioli@schiffhardin.com

*Counsel for Petitioner Prairie State Generating  
Company, LLC*

/s/ James Kaste

Peter K. Michael  
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF WYOMING  
James Kaste  
Deputy Attorney General  
*Counsel of Record*  
Erik Petersen  
Elizabeth Morrisseau  
Senior Assistant Attorneys General  
2320 Capitol Avenue  
Cheyenne, WY 82002  
Tel: (307) 777-6946  
Fax: (307) 777-3542  
james.kaste@wyo.gov

*Counsel for Petitioner State of Wyoming*

/s/ Allison D. Wood

Allison D. Wood  
Tauna M. Szymanski  
Andrew D. Knudsen  
HUNTON & WILLIAMS LLP  
2200 Pennsylvania Avenue, N.W.  
Washington, D.C. 20037  
Tel: (202) 955-1500  
awood@hunton.com  
tszymanski@hunton.com  
aknudsen@hunton.com

*Counsel for Petitioner Tri-State Generation and  
Transmission Association, Inc.*

/s/ William M. Bumpers

William M. Bumpers  
Megan H. Berge  
BAKER BOTTS L.L.P.  
1299 Pennsylvania Avenue, N.W.  
Washington, D.C. 20004  
Tel: (202) 639-7700  
william.bumpers@bakerbotts.com  
megan.berge@bakerbotts.com

*Counsel for Petitioner Westar Energy, Inc.*

/s/ Jeffrey R. Holmstead

Jeffrey R. Holmstead  
Brittany M. Pemberton  
BRACEWELL LLP  
2001 M Street, N.W., Suite 900  
Washington, D.C. 20036  
Tel: (202) 828-5852  
Fax: (202) 857-4812  
jeff.holmstead@bracewelllaw.com

*Counsel for Petitioner American Coalition for  
Clean Coal Electricity*

/s/ Dennis Lane

Dennis Lane  
STINSON LEONARD STREET LLP  
1775 Pennsylvania Ave., N.W., Suite 800  
Washington, D.C. 20006  
Tel: (202) 785-9100  
Fax: (202) 785-9163  
dennis.lane@stinson.com

Parthenia B. Evans  
STINSON LEONARD STREET LLP  
1201 Walnut Street, Suite 2900  
Kansas City, MO 64106  
Tel: (816) 842-8600  
Fax: (816) 691-3495  
parthy.evans@stinson.com

*Counsel for Petitioner Kansas City Board of  
Public Utilities – Unified Government of  
Wyandotte County/ Kansas City, Kansas*

/s/ Geoffrey K. Barnes  
Geoffrey K. Barnes  
Wendlene M. Lavey  
John D. Lazzaretti  
Robert D. Cheren  
SQUIRE PATTON BOGGS (US) LLP  
4900 Key Tower  
127 Public Square  
Cleveland, OH 44114  
Tel: (216) 479-8646  
geoffrey.barnes@squirepb.com

*Counsel for Petitioner Murray Energy  
Corporation*

/s/ Andrew C. Emrich  
Andrew C. Emrich  
HOLLAND & HART LLP  
6380 South Fiddlers Green Circle  
Suite 500  
Greenwood Village, CO 80111  
Tel: (303) 290-1621  
Fax: (866) 711-8046  
acemrich@hollandhart.com

Emily C. Schilling  
HOLLAND & HART LLP  
222 South Main Street, Suite 2200  
Salt Lake City, UT 84101  
Tel: (801) 799-5753  
Fax: (202) 747-6574  
ecschilling@hollandhart.com

*Counsel for Petitioners Newmont Nevada  
Energy Investment, LLC and Newmont USA  
Limited*

/s/ Charles T. Wehland

Charles T. Wehland

JONES DAY

77 West Wacker Drive, Suite 3500

Chicago, IL 60601-1692

Tel: (312) 782-3939

Fax: (312) 782-8585

ctwehland@jonesday.com

*Counsel for Petitioners The North American Coal Corporation; The Coteau Properties Company; Coyote Creek Mining Company, L.L.C.; The Falkirk Mining Company; Mississippi Lignite Mining Company; North American Coal Royalty Company; NODAK Energy Services, LLC; Otter Creek Mining Company, LLC; and The Sabine Mining Company*

/s/ Robert G. McLusky

Robert G. McLusky

JACKSON KELLY, PLLC

1600 Laidley Tower

P.O. Box 553

Charleston, WV 25322

Tel: (304) 340-1000

rmclusky@jacksonkelly.com

*Counsel for Petitioner West Virginia Coal Association*

/s/ Eugene M. Trisko

Eugene M. Trisko  
LAW OFFICES OF EUGENE M. TRISKO  
P.O. Box 596  
Berkeley Springs, WV 25411  
Tel: (304) 258-1977  
Tel: (301) 639-5238 (cell)  
emtrisko7@gmail.com

*Counsel for Petitioner International Brotherhood  
of Boilermakers, Iron Ship Builders,  
Blacksmiths, Forgers & Helpers*

/s/ Eugene M. Trisko

Eugene M. Trisko  
LAW OFFICES OF EUGENE M. TRISKO  
P.O. Box 596  
Berkeley Springs, WV 25411  
Tel: (304) 258-1977  
Tel: (301) 639-5238 (cell)  
emtrisko7@gmail.com

*Counsel for Petitioner International Brotherhood  
of Electrical Workers, AFL-CIO*

/s/ Grant F. Crandall

Grant F. Crandall  
General Counsel  
UNITED MINE WORKERS OF AMERICA  
18354 Quantico Gateway Drive  
Triangle, VA 22172  
Tel: (703) 291-2429  
gcrandall@umwa.org

Arthur Traynor, III  
Staff Counsel  
UNITED MINE WORKERS OF AMERICA  
18354 Quantico Gateway Drive  
Triangle, VA 22172  
Tel: (703) 291-2457  
atraynor@umwa.org

Eugene M. Trisko  
LAW OFFICES OF EUGENE M. TRISKO  
P.O. Box 596  
Berkeley Springs, WV 25411  
Tel: (304) 258-1977  
emtrisko7@gmail.com

*Counsel for Petitioner United Mine Workers of  
America*

/s/ Steven P. Lehotsky

Steven P. Lehotsky  
Sheldon B. Gilbert  
U.S. CHAMBER LITIGATION CENTER  
1615 H Street, N.W.  
Washington, D.C. 20062  
Tel: (202) 463-5337  
slehotsky@uschamber.com

*Counsel for Petitioner Chamber of Commerce of  
the United States of America*

/s/ Quentin Riegel

Linda E. Kelly  
Quentin Riegel  
Leland P. Frost  
MANUFACTURERS' CENTER FOR LEGAL  
ACTION  
733 10th Street, N.W., Suite 700  
Washington, D.C. 20001  
Tel: (202) 637-3000  
qriegel@nam.org

*Counsel for Petitioner National Association of  
Manufacturers*

/s/ Richard S. Moskowitz

Richard S. Moskowitz  
AMERICAN FUEL & PETROCHEMICAL  
MANUFACTURERS  
1667 K Street, N.W., Suite 700  
Washington, D.C. 20006  
Tel: (202) 457-0480  
rmoskowitz@afpm.org

*Counsel for Petitioner American Fuel &  
Petrochemical Manufacturers*

/s/ Karen R. Harned

Karen R. Harned  
Executive Director  
Elizabeth A. Milito  
NATIONAL FEDERATION OF  
INDEPENDENT BUSINESS  
SMALL BUSINESS LEGAL CENTER  
1201 F Street, N.W., Suite 200  
Washington, D.C. 20004  
Tel: (202) 314-2061  
karen.harned@nfib.org  
elizabeth.milito@nfib.org

*Counsel for Petitioner National Federation of  
Independent Business*

/s/ Megan H. Berge

Megan H. Berge  
William M. Bumpers  
BAKER BOTTS L.L.P.  
1299 Pennsylvania Avenue, N.W.  
Washington, D.C. 20004  
Tel: (202) 639-7700  
megan.berge@bakerbotts.com  
william.bumpers@bakerbotts.com

*Counsel for Petitioner National Association of  
Home Builders*



/s/ Kathryn D. Kirmayer  
Kathryn D. Kirmayer  
General Counsel  
Evelyn R. Nackman  
Associate General Counsel  
ASSOCIATION OF AMERICAN RAILROADS  
425 3rd Street, S.W.  
Washington, D.C. 20024  
Tel: (202) 639-2100  
kkirmayer@aar.org

*Counsel for Petitioner Association of American  
Railroads*

/s/ Chaim Mandelbaum  
Chaim Mandelbaum  
Litigation Manager  
FREE MARKET ENVIRONMENTAL LAW  
CLINIC  
726 N. Nelson Street, Suite 9  
Arlington, VA 22203  
Tel: (703) 577-9973  
chaim12@gmail.com

*Counsel for Petitioner Energy and Environment  
Legal Institute*

/s/ Catherine E. Stetson  
Catherine E. Stetson  
Eugene A. Sokoloff  
HOGAN LOVELLS US LLP  
555 Thirteenth Street, N.W.  
Washington, D.C. 20004-1109  
Tel: (202) 637-5600  
Fax: (202) 637-5910  
cate.stetson@hoganlovells.com  
eugene.sokoloff@hoganlovells.com

*Counsel for Petitioner Denbury Onshore, LLC*

/s/ Adam R.F. Gustafson

C. Boyden Gray

Adam R.F. Gustafson

*Counsel of Record*

James R. Conde

BOYDEN GRAY & ASSOCIATES, PLLC

801 17th Street, N.W., Suite 350

Washington, D.C. 20006

Tel: (202) 955-0620

gustafson@boydengrayassociates.com

*Counsel for Petitioners Competitive Enterprise  
Institute; Buckeye Institute for Public Policy  
Solutions; Independence Institute; Rio Grande  
Foundation; Sutherland Institute; Klaus J.  
Christoph; Samuel R. Damewood; Catherine C.  
Dellin; Joseph W. Luquire; Lisa R. Markham;  
Patrick T. Peterson; and Kristi Rosenquist*

Sam Kazman

Hans Bader

COMPETITIVE ENTERPRISE INSTITUTE

1310 L Street, N.W., 7th Floor

Washington, D.C. 20005

Tel: (202) 331-1010

*Counsel for Petitioner Competitive Enterprise  
Institute*

Robert Alt

BUCKEYE INSTITUTE FOR PUBLIC POLICY  
SOLUTIONS

88 E. Broad Street, Suite 1120

Columbus, OH 43215

Tel: (614) 224-4422

robert@buckeyeinstitute.org

*Counsel for Petitioner Buckeye Institute for  
Public Policy Solutions*

Tristan L. Duncan  
Thomas J. Grever  
SHOOK HARDY & BACON L.L.P.  
2555 Grand Boulevard  
Kansas City, MO 64018  
Tel: (816) 474-6550  
Fax: (816) 421-5547  
tlduncan@shb.com  
tgrever@shb.com

Jonathan S. Massey  
MASSEY & GAIL, LLP  
1325 G Street, N.W., Suite 500  
Washington, D.C. 20005  
Tel: (202) 652-4511  
Fax: (312) 379-0467  
jmassey@masseygail.com

*Counsel for Intervenors Dixon Bros., Inc.,  
Nelson Brothers, Inc., Wesco International, Inc.,  
Norfolk Southern Corp., Joy Global, Inc., and  
Peabody Energy Corporation in Support of  
Petitioners*

**CERTIFICATE OF COMPLIANCE**

1. This document complies with the type-volume limits of Fed. R. App. P. 27(d)(2) because, excluding the parts of the document exempted by Fed. R. App. P. 32(f), this document contains 2,299 words.

2. This document complies with the typeface requirements of Fed. R. App. P. 32(a)(5) and the type-style requirements of Fed. R. App. P. 32(a)(6) because this document has been prepared in a proportionally spaced typeface using Microsoft Word 2010 in 14-point Garamond font.

/s/ Peter D. Keisler  
Peter D. Keisler

*Counsel for Petitioners*

**CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

I hereby certify that, on this 6th day of April, 2017, a copy of the foregoing response was served electronically through the Court's CM/ECF system on all ECF-registered counsel.

/s/ Peter D. Keisler

Peter D. Keisler

*Counsel for Petitioners*